

## Consultation on CMT Structure July – August 2020

Consultation took place primarily through digital platforms or by telephone. Some elected members and trade unions chose to submit written feedback.

<b>Elected Members</b>	
Lib Dem Group	
Labour Group	
Green Group	
Conservatives	
Independents	Cllr. D Carr; Cllr, J Galvin; Cllr, M Waters provided written feedback

<b>Key stakeholders, Partners and Business Leaders</b>	
Phil Mettam	NHS Vale of York Clinical Commissioning Group
Charlie Jeffery	Vice Chancellor York University
Lee Probert	Principle York College
Simon Morrirt	CEX NHS York
Alison Semmence	CEX York CVS
Lt Col Balfour	Army
Andrew Digwood	York Chamber of Commerce President
Lisa Winward	NY Police
Karen Bryan	Vice Chancellor York St John
Carolyn Frank	Federation of Small Businesses, Development Manager North Yorkshire
Andrew Lawson	Executive Director   York Business Improvement District
Greg Dyke	Make It York
Andrew Blades	Fire and Rescue
<b>Officers directly affected</b>	
Members of CMT	Interim Head of Paid Service Corporate Directors for CEC, HHASC and EAP Director of Public Health Director of Governance Interim Section 151 Officer
Corporate Leadership Group	All Assistant Directors (9) Finance Managers (2) Head of Service Policy & Partnerships Head of Communications
<b>Trade Unions</b>	
Unison	Andrea Dudding
GMB	Mandy Swithenbank

## Feedback – Key Issues/Themes

<b>Elected Members</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ The Cex job title holds authority and feel the post should continue with that title. Do not believe Chief Operating Officer has the same level of autonomy.</li> <li>➤ Could expand the Chief Executive role to include more policy and customer service.</li> <li>➤ Feel there should be a review of Assistant Directors and the remit they cover.</li> <li>➤ The Head of Paid Service role needs to manage the member relationship</li> <li>➤ The present economic circumstance may dictate the way ahead</li> <li>➤ The authority needs a strong visible CEX to take on as much as possible of the business of the authority.</li> <li>➤ Needs a strong CEX to work in the political climate at York</li> <li>➤ Finance role not to be Assistant Director</li> <li>➤ Accept that the savings need to be made</li> <li>➤ Reflect the current climate re Covid and devolution / LG reform</li> <li>➤ Need to be mindful not to set up the council to be in a worse position due to current conditions</li> <li>➤ Too many direct reports</li> <li>➤ Can savings be made in numbers of Executive members, for the Executive to also lead by example</li> <li>➤ Importance of both an inward and outward facing Chief Executive, one that works collaboratively with the council's partners to meet and tackle the challenges the city faces, and appoint a Chief Executive in a competitive internal and external recruitment process to get the best individual for the role.</li> <li>➤ On the options presented so far, oppose both as we believe they would weaken the organisation's effectiveness both inside and outside the council.</li> <li>➤ Establish recruitment for a stand-alone position of Head of Paid Service and Chief Executive as currently exists.</li> <li>➤ Unfortunately both existing options (as illustrated in paper to SMU June 2020) close the council down to the sort of partnership working that is essential at any time to address the challenges York faces, and never more so than in the years ahead as we move out of the Covid 19 pandemic and seek to address the fast developing shock to the local economy.</li> <li>➤ We believe that having strong officer leadership in the form of a Chief Executive, with a responsibility that extends beyond the four walls of West Offices, is essential to understand the role the council plays in serving residents and businesses in this city, and which enables the council to act to meet the needs of those it should be serving.</li> </ul>
<b>Partners, key stakeholder</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ This is topical between business leaders</li> <li>➤ Needs officer leadership and a consistent message to come from the Council</li> <li>➤ Needs consistency in the CEX role which has not been therefore some time</li> <li>➤ Takes time to build relationships with partners</li> </ul>

- Needs a strong leader in the position of HoPS
- Business community keen to see CEX being replaced
- The lead role is to drive the vision, own the strategy, knock down doors and lead from the front
- There is a need to consider the pressures of a 4 yearly political cycle
- Strong person to lead
- Importance on projects and role to ensure that the projects do not become political footballs – the CEX role to keep that vision
- The Leader of the Council and CEX should be seen side by side. This relationship is crucial and personalities matter
- Charismatic leader, confident to lead the paid services
- Often the council is seen to be insular ‘within these walls’.
- Visible Officer Leadership is missing
- Need more joint working across partners of the City
- Leadership, visibility and strategic impact is required from the role of HofPS
- CEX role to look across all partners and see the bigger picture
- A paid staff member needs to be in place to protect the staff from the political pressures
- Key strategic direction required that goes passed the political timetables
- CEX role needs to understand the voluntary section and work across the Place Based Improvement Board
- Get the best person for the job. Bring in someone new
- CEX at the helm to lead
- A COO role would be more commercially focused which would be beneficial
- Residents and Businesses are both and should not be seen as separate

#### **Officer Feedback**

- Speed to get a structure in place, need the stability through a permanent Head of Paid service in which ever role Get on with it
- How will the rotation of the Deputy role actually work in practice? The impact on capacity of the Corporate Director being a nominal Deputy, what will that actually mean? Is 12 months too long for the rotation? Fell it should be a remunerated role. All Corporate Directors have within the Job Description deputisation for the CEX and therefore is a formal rotation required? Do need to have a clear second in command
- The title of the role not important
- Finance role should be equivalent to that of the Director of Governance
- A high number of direct reports on the Head of Paid Service role
- Opportunity to realign portfolios under AD’s in a review
- CEX is more commonly understood as a title
- Need a figurehead to effectively manage CMT
- The AD Finance role to be renamed as Chief Finance Officer
- Irrelevant what you call the job, however the perception of the role from outside the organisation is important
- Chief Operating Officer is not a familiar title in the sector
- The reduction of a post across CMT is a further reduction in this area and concern is raised that at a time of Covid, Devolution and Local government reform that there is an impact on staff
- CEX role title so it is seen as equivalent with CEX’s across the City and wider regional and national authorities

- The leader of the workforce to be outward facing and a clear link and commitment to partners
- Needs to be clear lines of sight between the CEX and the political leadership
- CEX distinctive leadership which should be longer term and stable
- Provides the voice of the council as an institution
- A city leadership role
- Too many direct reports
- To empower Assistant Directors to remove some of the decision making that goes up to CMT when not needed
- Empowerment and decision making to be at the right level
- Allow space for strategic management at the top level, therefore capacity needs to be right
- S151 role needs to be at the right level in line with CIPFA responsibilities
- Savings could be made across a wider remit rather than just CMT
- Impact on capacity within Finance department as a result of changing a Grade 12 role to AD
- Helpful to have a nominated Deputy so that in an unexpected absence then it is clear who stands up
- The structure needs to show that the Director of Public Health has a direct line to the Head of Paid service in their statutory role.
- The size of brief and roles for the Corporate Directors is massive in comparison to other authorities, other authorities have a larger span of AD's
- Option to not be too radical at this time as the Council needs stability to deliver in the current climate
- If the COO role is brought in that often has a financial background and hence the finance role can be at the AD level
- Leadership of Place
- Previous structure not fully implemented which has had a direct impact on Customer and Corporate Services

### **Trade Unions**

- Section 151 should not be an AD role
- CCS needs a director
- Too many direct reports
- Option A as presented in the paper to SMU in June 2020 is the preferred
- Feel that the organisation needs a single lead Head of Paid Service that is a Chief Executive and has the autonomy to be that lead Officer over the entire organisation. It is times such as we are experiencing now that shows staff look to a single Chief Officer for guidance and support.
- Directors which form the Corporate Management Team all have their particular expertise, however an organisation such as ours should have that Chief Officer that does look at the organisation in a whole and represents, supports and protects the entire staff cohort and the residents of the City to ensure that the City of York Council champion any partnership working to ensure that all the needs of the City are supported.
- Feel the role of a Chief Operating Officer with a more internal focus, would not deliver the needs of the entire City.

- feel that the Statutory Function of 151 should sit at a Chief Officer level, and therefore understand the Assistant Director status of this post going forward, however that post should also have a seat at the CMT table.
- Ideally feel the Section 151 post should stay at Director level as previously indicated, however regrettably also mindful of the need to achieve the savings that have already been imposed on the Corporate Management Team.